

## **West Virginia Ethics Commission**

### **Meeting Minutes February 6, 2025**

The February 6, 2025, meeting of the West Virginia Ethics Commission was called to order in the Commission's office at 210 Brooks Street, Charleston, West Virginia, at 10:00 a.m. by Chairperson Wolfe. Commissioners and the public were invited to attend in person, via video link, and via telephone.

#### **Present**

Robert J. Wolfe, Commission chairperson  
D. Blake Carter, Jr., Commission member (virtual)  
Joshua Cottle, Commission member (by telephone)  
Lynn Davis, Commission member (by telephone)  
Karen Disibbio, Commission member (by telephone)  
Jordan K. Herrick, Commission member (virtual)  
Robert Harman, Commission member (by telephone)  
Suzan Singleton, Commission member (virtual)  
Terry Walker, Commission member (virtual)  
Kimberly B. Weber, Executive Director  
John Roush, Interim General Counsel  
Rachel Carpenter, Executive Assistant

#### **Approval of Minutes**

Mr. Carter made a motion to approve the minutes of the Commission's February 6, 2025, meeting. Ms. Disibbio seconded the motion, and the motion carried as follows:

Carter -aye  
Cottle – aye  
Davis – aye  
Disibbio – aye  
Harman -aye  
Herrick - aye  
Singleton – aye  
Walker - abstain  
Wolfe – aye

#### **Recap of Previous Month**

Ms. Weber provided a summary of news and developments relating to the Ethics Commission during the previous month.

## Employment Exemption Requests

Ms. Weber asked the Commission to ratify the following temporary employment exemptions that she had granted since the last Commission meeting.

### **EE 2024-81**

Bennett Murphy, Highway Engineer Trainee II, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

### **EE 2024-82**

Phillip Cook, Transportation Engineer/Evaluation Engineer, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

### **EE 2024-83**

Keeling Fife, District Bridge Engineer, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

### **EE 2024-84**

Brigitte M. Codling, Civil Rights Senior Specialist, Department of Highways

### **EE 2024-85**

Jason Hamilton, Regional Construction Engineer, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

### **EE 2024-86**

Cynthia Persily, Cabinet Secretary, Department of Human Services

### **EE 2024-87**

Jason Tharp, Regional Construction Engineer – Contract Administration, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

### **EE 2024-88**

David Scott Abbott, Integrated Construction Technologies Supervisor, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

### **EE 2024-89**

Mark C. Dickson, TRET SR – Concrete Section, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

### **EE 2024-90**

Jay R. Wallace, D6, Construction, Area Engineer, HENGR, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

### **EE 2024-91**

Travis Long, Division Director, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

**EE 2025-01**

Jennifer Dooley, Deputy Secretary of Transportation, Department of Transportation

**EE 2025-02**

Lucinda Butler, Commissioner of Division of Multimodal Transportation Facilities, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

**EE 2025-03**

Mark Nettleton, Transportation Engineer-Geotechnical Section Leader, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

**EE 2025-04**

Anthony Testa, HTRETSR, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

**EE 2025-05**

Brad Cottrell, District 6 Construction - Highway Engineer Trainee, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

**EE 2025-06**

Kira R. Robinson, D-1 Transportation Engineer Technician, Department of Transportation

Mr. Carter moved that Employment Exemptions 2024-81 through 2025-06 be ratified. Ms. Disibbio seconded the motion, and the motion carried as follows:

Carter - aye  
Cottle - aye  
Davis – aye  
Disibbio – aye  
Harman - aye  
Herrick – aye  
Singleton – aye  
Walker - aye  
Wolfe – aye

**Advisory Opinion Requests**

Mr. Wolfe called upon Ms. Weber to present [Advisory Opinion 2025-01](#) to the Commission for consideration. Ms. Weber presented the proposed Advisory Opinion. Mr. Carter made a motion that the Advisory Opinion be approved as presented. Ms. Disibbio seconded the motion, and the motion carried as follows:

Carter - aye  
Cottle – aye  
Davis – aye

Disibbio – aye  
Harman - aye  
Herrick – aye  
Singleton – aye  
Walker - aye  
Wolfe – aye

Mr. Wolfe called upon Mr. Roush to present [Advisory Opinion 2025-02](#) to the Commission for consideration. Mr. Roush presented the proposed Advisory Opinion. Mr. Carter made a motion that the Advisory Opinion be approved as presented. Ms. Disibbio seconded the motion, and the motion carried as follows:

Carter - aye  
Cottle – aye  
Davis – aye  
Disibbio – aye  
Harman - aye  
Herrick – aye  
Singleton – aye  
Walker - aye  
Wolfe – aye

### **Approve Purchasing Card Monthly Report**

The Commission reviewed the (attached) purchasing card monthly reports for November and December 2024. Ms. Weber reported that invoices were available for review and recommended that the purchases be approved. A motion was made by Mr. Carter to approve the reports as presented. Mr. Harman seconded the motion, and the motion carried as follows. The purchasing card monthly reports are attached to these minutes and incorporated herein.

Carter - aye  
Cottle – aye  
Davis – aye  
Disibbio – aye  
Harman - aye  
Herrick - aye  
Singleton – aye  
Walker - aye  
Wolfe – aye

### **Lobbyist Annual Compliance Audit**

Mr. Wolfe called upon Ms. Weber to give a report on the results of the lobbyist audit. Ms. Weber reported that the 2024 lobbyist audit has been completed by Rollins, Cleavenger and Rollins, CPAs. CPA Bob Bailey requested documentation from the following 20

andomly selected lobbyists to support the expenditures they reported in Lobbyist Activity Reports filed for 2023:

The following lobbyists were audited:

Rob Burton  
Patrick Cadle  
J. Randolph Cheetham  
Elaine Darling  
Kurt Dettinger  
James Fealy  
Richard Goszka, Jr.  
Andrea Greene  
Patti Hamilton  
Alex Macia  
Matthew McComas  
Melaine Pagliaro  
Karen Price  
Larry Puccio  
Phil Reale  
Lida Shepherd  
Glenn Spencer  
Sherri Talkington  
Stephanie Wissman  
Emily Womeldorff

Ms. Singleton made a motion that the Commission find that no further activity is required by Mr. Bailey; that there is no information disclosed in the reports relating to lobbyist compensation or other information which is not required to be disclosed. Mr. Carter seconded, and the motion was carried as follows:

Carter - aye  
Cottle – aye  
Davis – aye  
Disibbio – aye  
Harman - aye  
Herrick - aye  
Singleton – aye  
Walker - aye  
Wolfe – aye

### **Lobbyist Compliance Audit Resolution**

Mr. Wolfe asked for a motion to adopt the (attached) resolution to set the terms of the 2025 lobbyist compliance audit. A motion was made by Ms. Singleton that the Commission continue conducting one lottery auditing 20 randomly selected lobbyists in 2025. Ms. Disibbio seconded, and the motion carried as follows:


Carter -aye  
Cottle – aye  
Davis – aye  
Disibbio – aye  
Harman -aye  
Herrick - aye  
Singleton – aye  
Walker - aye  
Wolfe – aye

### Adjournment


Mr. Walker made a motion to adjourn, and Ms. Disibbio seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows, and the meeting was adjourned.

Carter - aye  
Cottle – aye  
Davis – aye  
Disibbio – aye  
Harman -aye  
Herrick – aye  
Singleton – aye  
Walker - aye  
Wolfe – aye

The foregoing minutes of the West Virginia Ethics Commission were approved at the Commission’s March 6, 2025, meeting.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Robert J. Wolfe, Chairperson  
West Virginia Ethics Commission

ATTEST:

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Rachel Y. Carpenter, Executive Assistant  
West Virginia Ethics Commission