West Virginia Ethics Commission

Meeting Minutes February 6, 2025

The February 6, 2025, meeting of the West Virginia Ethics Commission was called to order in the Commission's office at 210 Brooks Street, Charleston, West Virginia, at 10:00 a.m. by Chairperson Wolfe. Commissioners and the public were invited to attend in person, via video link, and via telephone.

Present

Robert J. Wolfe, Commission chairperson D. Blake Carter, Jr., Commission member (virtual) Joshua Cottle, Commission member (by telephone) Lynn Davis, Commission member (by telephone) Karen Disibbio, Commission member (by telephone) Jordan K. Herrick, Commission member (virtual) Robert Harman, Commission member (by telephone) Suzan Singleton, Commission member (virtual) Terry Walker, Commission member (virtual) Kimberly B. Weber, Executive Director John Roush, Interim General Counsel Rachel Carpenter, Executive Assistant

Approval of Minutes

Mr. Carter made a motion to approve the minutes of the Commission's February 6, 2025, meeting. Ms. Disibbio seconded the motion, and the motion carried as follows:

Carter -aye Cottle – aye Davis – aye Disibbio – aye Harman -aye Herrick - aye Singleton – aye Walker - abstain Wolfe – aye

Recap of Previous Month

Ms. Weber provided a summary of news and developments relating to the Ethics Commission during the previous month.

Employment Exemption Requests

Ms. Weber asked the Commission to ratify the following temporary employment exemptions that she had granted since the last Commission meeting.

<u>EE 2024-81</u>

Bennett Murphy, Highway Engineer Trainee II, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

<u>EE 2024-82</u>

Phillip Cook, Transportation Engineer/Evaluation Engineer, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

<u>EE 2024-83</u>

Keeling Fife, District Bridge Engineer, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

EE 2024-84

Brigitte M. Codling, Civil Rights Senior Specialist, Department of Highways

EE 2024-85

Jason Hamilton, Regional Construction Engineer, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

EE 2024-86

Cynthia Persily, Cabinet Secretary, Department of Human Services

EE 2024-87

Jason Tharp, Regional Construction Engineer – Contract Administration, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

EE 2024-88

David Scott Abbott, Integrated Construction Technologies Supervisor, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

<u>EE 2024-89</u>

Mark C. Dickson, TRETSR – Concrete Section, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

EE 2024-90

Jay R. Wallace, D6, Construction, Area Engineer, HENGR, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

<u>EE 2024-91</u>

Travis Long, Division Director, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

EE 2025-01

Jennifer Dooley, Deputy Secretary of Transportation, Department of Transportation

<u>EE 2025-02</u>

Lucinda Butler, Commissioner of Division of Multimodal Transportation Facilities, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

EE 2025-03

Mark Nettleton, Transportation Engineer-Geotechnical Section Leader, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

EE 2025-04

Anthony Testa, HTRETSR, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

EE 2025-05

Brad Cottrell, District 6 Construction - Highway Engineer Trainee, Department of Transportation, Division of Highways

EE 2025-06

Kira R. Robinson, D-1 Transportation Engineer Technician, Department of Transportation

Mr. Carter moved that Employment Exemptions 2024-81 through 2025-06 be ratified. Ms. Disibbio seconded the motion, and the motion carried as follows:

Carter - aye Cottle - aye Davis – aye Disibbio – aye Harman - aye Herrick – aye Singleton – aye Walker - aye Wolfe – aye

Advisory Opinion Requests

Mr. Wolfe called upon Ms. Weber to present <u>Advisory Opinion 2025-01</u> to the Commission for consideration. Ms. Weber presented the proposed Advisory Opinion. Mr. Carter made a motion that the Advisory Opinion be approved as presented. Ms. Disibbio seconded the motion, and the motion carried as follows:

Carter - aye Cottle – aye Davis – aye Disibbio – aye Harman - aye Herrick – aye Singleton – aye Walker - aye Wolfe – aye

Mr. Wolfe called upon Mr. Roush to present <u>Advisory Opinion 2025-02</u> to the Commission for consideration. Mr. Roush presented the proposed Advisory Opinion. Mr. Carter made a motion that the Advisory Opinion be approved as presented. Ms. Disibbio seconded the motion, and the motion carried as follows:

Approve Purchasing Card Monthly Report

The Commission reviewed the (attached) purchasing card monthly reports for November and December 2024. Ms. Weber reported that invoices were available for review and recommended that the purchases be approved. A motion was made by Mr. Carter to approve the reports as presented. Mr. Harman seconded the motion, and the motion carried as follows. The purchasing card monthly reports are attached to these minutes and incorporated herein.

Carter - aye Cottle – aye Davis – aye Disibbio – aye Harman - aye Herrick - aye Singleton – aye Walker - aye Wolfe – aye

Lobbyist Annual Compliance Audit

Mr. Wolfe called upon Ms. Weber to give a report on the results of the lobbyist audit. Ms. Weber reported that the 2024 lobbyist audit has been completed by Rollins, Cleavenger and Rollins, CPAs. CPA Bob Bailey requested documentation from the following 20

Carter - aye Cottle – aye Davis – aye Disibbio – aye Harman - aye Herrick – aye Singleton – aye Walker - aye Wolfe – aye

andomly selected lobbyists to support the expenditures they reported in Lobbyist Activity Reports filed for 2023:

The following lobbyists were audited:

Rob Burton Patrick Cadle J. Randolph Cheetham Elaine Darling Kurt Dettinger James Fealv Richard Goszka. Jr. Andrea Greene Patti Hamilton Alex Macia Matthew McComas Melaine Pagliaro Karen Price Larry Puccio Phil Reale Lida Shepherd **Glenn Spencer** Sherri Talkington Stephanie Wissman **Emily Womeldorff**

Ms. Singleton made a motion that the Commission find that no further activity is required by Mr. Bailey; that there is no information disclosed in the reports relating to lobbyist compensation or other information which is not required to be disclosed. Mr. Carter seconded, and the motion was carried as follows:

Carter - aye Cottle – aye Davis – aye Disibbio – aye Harman - aye Herrick - aye Singleton – aye Walker - aye Wolfe – aye

Lobbyist Compliance Audit Resolution

Mr. Wolfe asked for a motion to adopt the (attached) resolution to set the terms of the 2025 lobbyist compliance audit. A motion was made by Ms. Singleton that the Commission continue conducting one lottery auditing 20 randomly selected lobbyists in 2025. Ms. Disibbio seconded, and the motion carried as follows:

Carter -aye Cottle – aye Davis – aye Disibbio – aye Harman -aye Herrick - aye Singleton – aye Walker - aye Wolfe – aye

Adjournment

Mr. Walker made a motion to adjourn, and Ms. Disibbio seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows, and the meeting was adjourned.

Carter - aye Cottle – aye Davis – aye Disibbio – aye Harman -aye Herrick – aye Singleton – aye Walker - aye Wolfe – aye

The foregoing minutes of the West Virginia Ethics Commission were approved at the Commission's March 6, 2025, meeting.

Robert J. Wolfe, Chairperson West Virginia Ethics Commission

ATTEST:

Rachel Y. Carpenter, Executive Assistant West Virginia Ethics Commission